

Mid-Term Review Report

PAKISTAN

SHAHMIR HAMID

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION.....	2
CONTEXT.....	2
PROGRESS AND RESULTS	4
M&E REFLECTION (MONITORING AND LEARNING PROCESS)	4
THEORY OF CHANGE (TOC).....	6
PARTNERSHIPS.....	9
LESSONS LEARNED AND IMPLICATIONS FOR THE PROGRAMME 2019/2020	12
IMPLICATIONS FOR THE YES I DO PROGRAMME FOR 2019/2020⁷	15
ANNEX 1. RESULTS SECTION.....	18

Introduction

The Yes I do Alliance (YIDA) in Pakistan is implementing a five year intervention (2016-2020) in Sindh province with the overall objective to empower adolescent girls and boys to decide if, when and whom to marry and if and when to have children. The programme focuses on reducing the incidence of Child Marriages (CM) and Teenage Pregnancies (TP) and minimizing the effect of these harmful practices in the target regions by providing Life Skill Based Education (LSBE), Vocational Skills to enhance Economic Empowerment opportunities and increasing access and use of youth friendly SRH services for adolescent girls and boys to improve their Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights (SRHR) status along with enhancing continued education for girls.

The Yes I do Alliance in Pakistan comprises Rutgers Pakistan and Plan International Pakistan. Sindh Agriculture and Forestry Workers Cooperation Organization (SAFWCO) is engaged as a local implementing partner. All the organizations are committed to the issues of Child Marriage and Teenage Pregnancy.

2018 was officially the third year of Yes I Do Programme and marked the mid-way point of the programme. Reaching this important milestone brought with it the mid-term review (MTR) of the programme, a process that ran through most of the year and culminates with this report. Under the MTR, a qualitative mid-line study by KIT and local researchers was conducted and monitoring data was collected by YIDA Pakistan. The result was two reports for which a multitude of both qualitative and quantitative indicators were measured, to assess the progress that has been made since the inception of the programme and the baseline.

The results of the two reports were then deliberated upon extensively in a 4-day participatory workshop in September 2018 that included all partners and members of the alliance. This workshop was an opportunity for everyone¹ to come together and reflect on the progress made and the strengths and weaknesses of the programme. In light of the evidence and the in-depth discussions, many recommendations were made on how to move forward and what changes to make. In all discussions held, the vision and goal of YID stood as the guiding light to which everyone strived.

This report is a culmination of all of those efforts. It has been divided into 9 sections, all taking the reader through the different building blocks of the MTR process.

Context²

a. Brief description of the context

Pakistan is an Islamic Republic and hence a relatively religious country where religious groups have increasing influence over public policy and cultural values. With the advent of the 18th amendment in 2010,

¹ Representatives from Rutgers Pakistan, Rutgers Netherlands, Plan Pakistan, Plan Netherlands, Royal Tropical Institute (KIT) and SAFWCO.

² Source: Context reflection exercise MTR workshop

provinces gained a large amount of autonomy and therefore each province has a different socio-political and cultural context. In Sindh, where YIDA is implementing in two districts, the environment is progressive and hence more favourable for YIDA. For example, Sindh is the only province of Pakistan where the SCMR 2013 (Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act) sets minimum age of marriage for girls is 18. Similarly, it is the only province to have legislated on Hindu Marriages allowing minorities the right to register their marriages and enforce the minimum age of 18 for marriage, along with many other such progressive steps. However, in terms of child marriage, the element of implementation remains weak across the country.

- b. Assessment of context changes - with reference to context, risks, gender and actors - since the inception phase and implications for the programme

General elections were held in Pakistan on 25th August 2018, thus bringing about the second peaceful transition of power between civilian governments in Pakistan's short history. With 10 years of civilian and democratic rule, many democratic norms have started taking root in Pakistan. However, the results of the recent elections have set the tone for a possible tumultuous era. The previous 2 party system has been uprooted and a third force led by cricketer turned politician Imran Khan and his Pakistan Tehreek Insaf (PTI) have found themselves in a position to form coalition governments in the Centre along with Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. As of today, the government is still developing their policies with major speculation regarding what shape they will take.

Pakistan is prone to natural disasters in which floods remain an everlasting challenge. Similarly, the issue of water conservation has been thrown into the limelight with evidence showing that the water levels in the country are drastically low. A nationwide campaign has been initiated to build 3 major dams in the country and awareness about the issue has grown enormously. However, the dams, if constructed, will take a decade at least and won't solve the short-term crisis. This could have a major impact in the implementation of the YID programme because government priorities would be shifted towards solving the water crisis and its economic implications. This could result in a departure from other social and human development related issues.

Although the security situation has improved across the country and terror related incidents have decreased, religious conservatism is on the rise. The most recent example is the issue related to an amendment of a government document that resulted in charges of blasphemy and an outcry by religious groups³. The same group was able to secure a large vote in the recent elections and has been popularised into the mainstream. These recent developments have pushed the new government's agenda significantly towards the right with more conservative policies being espoused along with discrimination on the basis of religion. However, in Sindh, the progressive Pakistan People's Party has secured power once again. Nearing the end of their last government they expressed interest in the inclusion of LSBE in primary school curriculum and there is a strong likelihood that that process will be continued again.

The decrease in terror related incidents has however had a negative consequence, in that the space for civil society has decreased and security agencies have substantially increased their involvement in various spheres of life. This has had a direct impact on the programme wherein, foreign funding and private

³ Source: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/2017_Faizabad_sit-in

organisations working in the social sectors have come into question. Rutgers and Plan specifically have had their registrations cancelled in December 2017 and were awaiting a final decision on their appeal. The most immediate impact of this issue was the withdrawal of YID implementation in Umerkot as it was seen as a sensitive district due to its border with India. YIDA Pakistan was given the indication that operating in Umerkot would cause certain problems in the registration process and therefore decided to relocate to Hyderabad.

Despite multiple efforts in catering to government requests, Both Rutgers and Plan were among the 18 INGOs that were informed by Ministry of Interior through an official correspondence on 2nd October 2018 that their appeals had been rejected⁴. Both organizations are currently devising their individual strategies in the light of this decision by the Government of Pakistan.

Progress and Results⁵

Refer to Annex 1

M&E reflection (Monitoring and learning process)⁶

- a. Reflection on whether the M&E framework enables the program to show all results/achievements in terms of outputs and outcomes (Does the framework measure what we want to know (our role to change)? Why (not)?)

The Country PME framework was adapted from the generic framework developed for the YID programme in 2016. The adaptation was mainly done based on the country-specific Theory of Change. The indicators were formulated per pathway consisting of sphere of control, sphere of influence and sphere of interest. The design of the framework included the following information;

- The Indicators were set to identify what information is required to monitor progress and results in each pathway
- The information flow was included; i.e. data collection (how, frequency, who), data analysis (what, who and how), reporting lines (who will report to which organization without losing the integrated nature of the M&E framework) and decision-making.

In theory, the Framework is a useful tool enabling the team to reflect on the progress and achievements of the programme. However, in the Pakistan context it was found that there is significant room for improvement as there are multiple challenges that have been discussed in the MTR workshop and have been summarised in the section below.

⁴ Source: <https://www.nytimes.com/reuters/2018/10/04/world/asia/04reuters-pakistan-ngos.html>

⁵ Source: Bi-annual reports implementing partners, IATI Dashboard, presentation progress and results MTR workshop, Reflection Progress/ToC tool MTR workshop

⁶ Source: M&E reflection MTR workshop

- b. Assessment of how the results of the M&E framework have been used to reflect, learn and/or improve our Yes I Do programme with the data we collect

The PME system provides information that is used to make informed programming decisions. YIDA Pakistan members report on the outcome and output indicators from the PME framework to reflect on progress. The PME core group collects and collates the data and periodically updates the framework which is then assessed by the programme teams and implementing partners. The data is compared with the assigned targets to assess whether or not the programme activities are on track. Similarly, this gives an insight into the quality of the implementation. The PME framework is useful in strategic decision making and planning and in assigning targets and allocating budgets for certain activities.

However, it was observed that there was a lack of ownership of the PME system by the programme teams and by extension the implementing partners. The PME core group is responsible for managing and updating the PME framework. However, since the programme teams and implementing partners are not involved in this process, they do not always look at programming decisions from the PME lens and therefore it's not always incorporated in target setting and planning.

- c. Description of challenges faced with the M&E framework (possibly related to measurements of indicators, tools, formats or any other M&E related issue)

The PME framework was amended several times in 2017 to make it more user friendly in terms of simple language of indicators and establishing a link among the pathways specially pathways 2 and 3.

As a result of deliberations at the Annual Review Meeting (ARM) 2017, some of the indicators were re-formulated after the inputs of NL colleagues and field implementors due to the fact that some were either too difficult to measure or inappropriate to the cultural context. For example, the initial indicator 'number of girls who have a child and follow education' was changed to 'number of girls who are married and follow education'. This was deemed more relevant in the Pakistan context. Five year targets were also set for each indicator while baseline values were added as per the data provided in IATI after consultation with the M&E desk.

The following challenges regarding the M&E system were highlighted and discussed during the MTR workshop:

- The indicators proved to be a challenge to monitor and measure because there were too many of them. In fact, only some key indicators were prioritised for the MTR by the PME core group due to this reason.
- Some indicators were not measured regularly due to logistical reasons such as high set targets and lack of proper resources. E.g. Peer education targets were too high to monitor regularly
- In some cases, such as LSBE in schools, no outcomes were formulated to monitor the quality of the work
- Some indicators are not measured accurately due to missing or inaccurate data especially those indicators which use government data as a reference.
- Use of collected data for analysis and decision making is not optimal because PME lies largely with PME staff not so much with the programme team or implementing partners.

- d. Description of suggested and required actions for improvement of the M&E system if any (indicators, framework, data collection, reporting, formats etc.)?

Following are recommendations for improvement of the PME framework:

- The framework has many indicators in each pathway. There is a need to identify the right indicators to make management decisions. For this, the indicators are to be reviewed in 2019 to streamline the framework.
- Targets of peer education through the cascade model are too ambitious. It is difficult to monitor and track all the results in detail. So, the targets and outreach strategy need to be revised to make it realistic. For example, with the peer education targets, a more realistic measurement and quality assurance approach needs to be developed.
- Involve implementing partners in data collection so that they take ownership of the M&E systems and are able to incorporate the results in their planning.
- Standardized reporting templates for proper information and data reporting.
- Increase frequency of field visits and interaction with beneficiaries to collect timely data that will help timely programmatic decision making.

Theory of Change (ToC)⁷

- a. Reflection whether the sum of the outcomes of the pathways will lead to the overall goal and impact as described in the ToC

YIDA Pakistan has built its programme interventions around 3 main pillars, i.e (1) The Whole School Approach⁸ and (2) the Kiran Model⁹ led by Rutgers and (3) the youth economic empowerment model¹⁰ led by Plan. The activities fall under these 3 main pillars and aim to contribute to the multiple outputs and outcomes of the TOC. With nearly half of the programme intervention period completed and a mid-line conducted to provide evidence, it was found that the ToC in its original shape still remains as valid today as it did at the time of its inception.

The MTR workshop held from 10-14th September 2018 brought together all the YIDA partners and provided them with an opportunity to conduct an evidence-based reflection on the TOC and its relevance. The result of these deliberations was that the sum of the outcomes of the pathways will lead to the overall

⁷ Source: Reflection Progress/ToC tool MTR workshop

⁸ WSA engages with schools i.e. administration, teachers, parents and students in a manner that creates a positive environment for LSBE and SRHR in schools.

⁹ School going boy and girls from classes 7-10 who are taught LSBE are known as Kiran. From those Kirans, a select group of motivated adolescents are given training in community mobilisation and leadership and advocacy and are known as Kiran Plus who form the Kiran Network. Kiran Plus are engaged in advocacy within their communities and with policy makers.

¹⁰ YEE model led by Plan aims to create economic empowerment opportunities for girls and provides them with skills they need to find employment and stay in school.

goal and impact as identified in the TOC. However, within each pathway, programmatic challenges were identified that were seen to be hindering the overall goal set out by YIDA.

- b. Description of insights gained from the (Operational, and Baseline/Midline) research: how do the findings of the research relate to the ToC?

The insights from the baseline and mid line, along with a comparison of their findings have been eye opening for YIDA Pakistan as they have provided valuable information on the basis of which decisions can be made.

With reference to the TOC, the mid line results show very clearly that the role of parents and community elders are important in the changing of norms. This aspect has been raised in different sections of this report and validates the need for more engagement by the Programme team directly with parents who are major gatekeepers to any sort of change. Similarly, the rigidity of norms within local communities was highlighted as an impediment to change and one that was seemingly difficult to breach. In light of these findings, it was agreed that YIDA Pakistan would revert back to the original, generic TOC wherein attitude change was marked as the goal for Pathway 1.

The mid line also shows that largely due to YIDA interventions, access to and provision of SRHR information has increased dramatically. Information on child marriage laws and legislation and the harms of teenage pregnancies has also similarly increased amongst adolescents. The mid line shows that service provision had also improved but was limited to outreach services i.e. at schools and home visits. However, uptake of SRH services at facility-level was almost absent. In fact, it was observed that any change in the use of health services was due to YIDA interventions and not driven by health care providers themselves.

Additionally, the mid line indicated that schools were safe spaces where adolescents were able to talk relatively freely amongst their peers, however bullying by peers was a concern that was raised, if the girls were married or pregnant. Similarly, evidence showed that sexual harassment on the way to schools was a major concern for parents and young people themselves.

With reference to advocacy, the original TOC placed emphasis on the creation of laws and other instruments that would hinder CM and TP. However, in the context of YIDA Pakistan's implementing districts, the relatively recent laws are deemed to be sufficient and no further legislation is required. However, what was found to be missing in the districts, was a strict implementation of those existing laws. This highlights the need to revise YIDA Pakistan's key advocacy tasks to focus solely on the implementation of existing legal framework.

In summary and in the contrast to the baseline, the mid line showed that awareness about SRHR, LSBE and existing laws on CM had increased, economic opportunities for girls had increased and the importance of economic empowerment of girls and the benefits of continued education for girls was more widely acknowledged amongst communities. In addition, the mid line showed that schools were seen as safe zones. However, one could surmise from the mid line findings that these changes were evident amongst targeted adolescents and trained facilitators such as health care providers and teachers. At the community level however, the findings highlighted the important role of parents in their children's lives and that the rigidity of norms that stemmed from parents had a major impact on the decisions and life choices of

adolescents. This was coupled with an inter-generational, communication gap that proves to be a barrier. In essence, if parents are not on board, the awareness and access to services and information will not create the intended impact. Furthermore, the mid line findings also clearly indicated that religious leaders were considered influential in changing social norms.

c. Validation and/or revision of the Theory of Change (ToC) and its underlying assumptions:

- Description of the suggested alterations to be made in the ToC.

As mentioned in part A of this section, it was agreed that YIDA Pakistan does not prescribe any changes to its TOC in light of the results of the mid line, as the chain of outputs, assumptions and outcomes are still valid and do theoretically lead to the eventual goal and impact of YIDA. However, implementing and operationalizing certain outputs were challenging and hence impacted the realisation of the outcome. For example: under pathway 1 mid line data showed that the element of community engagement was weak and therefore would hinder the goal of creating a social movement. In that regard it was discussed that it may be wise to not only focus more on community engagement but to also reverse the outcomes and bring social movement into the sphere of interest and replace it with 'changed attitudes of parents and community members' as it was in the original generic TOC of Yes I Do.

Under pathway 5, the focus needs to change from the creation of new laws to implementation of existing laws and this would require an amendment in the ToC.

- Description whether the assumptions can be validated or need to be adapted based on the available evidence or field experience

The premise of the YID programme is valid if the following ten assumptions hold to be true.

1. Only a combined approach of strategies will reduce Child Marriages and Teenage Pregnancies.
2. Policy makers and duty bearers are as much influenced by social and cultural norms, as people in communities.
3. Change makers are willing to organizing themselves to influence community members and to hold duty bearers accountable.
4. When adolescent girls and boys have improved knowledge concerning their rights and how to exercise their rights, they want to organize themselves to influence others, including their family members.
5. When adolescent girls finish post-primary education and complete LSBE, as well as prepared for economic activities, they have more chances to be economically empowered.
6. Through rights awareness and alternatives, people will internalize the issue and take action to change their social environment.
7. Meaningful youth engagement needs to be nurtured for increased access and uptake of quality ASRHR services and information.
8. When girls and boys are meaningfully engaged to claim their SRHR they will take informed action on their SRH

9. Through participating in intergenerational dialogues, men and boys become allies in changing social norms.
10. Engaged private sector actors are willing to provide traineeships and create employment options and conducive work environment for young women in vocational training and internships.

The deliberations of the MTR workshop found that all 10 assumptions, with certain caveats that were discussed in great detail, still hold to be true.

Partnerships¹¹

- a. Assessment of the coherence (communication, connection, collaboration) of the alliance
 - i. Short description of the evolvement of the alliance and the influence on the way of working.

The YID alliance in Pakistan was a very organic formation that gelled from the onset. Initially, the alliance included Rutgers and Plan, with Rutgers in the lead. These two partners were able to gain from each other's areas of expertise and resources in developing a workable and impactful design for the YID programme in Pakistan. In the second phase, SAFWCO was engaged as an implementing partner by Rutgers and was extremely effective due to its local networks and offices in the YID implementing districts. This partnership remained very positive and fruitful wherein all 3 partners were able to tap into each other's resources and expertise to further the programme goals. This alliance is now evolving further with Plan's addition of another implementing partner IRM (Institute of Rural Management) in 2019.

- ii. Successes and challenges of the collaboration and communication

The collaboration between partners at the in country level has been positive. Constant and multiple communication channels at all relevant levels of the organisations have led to seamless conditions in terms of programme implementation. The existing governance structures have allowed for multiple forums of collaboration and communication that are utilised on a regular basis.

Similarly, collaboration with implementing partners at the field level is also just as positive. A very clear communication channel established in the governance structures has allowed for seamless collaboration and discussion of problems and grievances. However, it was identified that there is still room for improvement in the horizontal communication and collaboration between field level partners (IPs). As a new IP (implementing partner) is being inducted in 2019, it was recognised that the relationship

¹¹ Source: partnership survey and alliance thermometer exercise MTR workshop

between IRM and SAFWCO needs to be focused to ensure better collaboration at the field level between partners.

Collaboration between the Pakistan and Netherlands alliance members is of a different nature. One chain of communication runs within organisations and their respective headquarters and hierarchies whereas the YIDA chain of communication follows a different pattern. In both cases, collaboration has been mostly positive and communication channels on both ends remain open and frequently utilised. However, it was identified that in some cases the two streams overlap and can lead to less than optimal communication which can sometimes lead to miscommunication and inefficiencies. It was agreed that this communication channel would be revisited.

- iii. Costs/benefit analysis: description of the relation between the costs (in terms of resources e.g. time/ staff capacity) and the extra results (in terms of result achievement, new partnerships, exchanging knowledge and skills, reputation, etc.).

As is evident from the section above, the benefits of the alliance clearly outweigh the costs. In terms of costs, the multiple communication channels do require extra resources such as time. This is due to the nature of the programme that sometimes requires all partners and stakeholders to be on the same page when taking decisions so as not to disrupt activities, commitments, set plans and targets.

On the benefit side however, the constant communication and joint decision making processes allow for learning and experience sharing opportunities that ultimately benefit the programme and its intended objectives. Similarly, increased staff and technical capacity leads to enhanced result achievement and improves quality checks in the implementation and planning phases of the programme.

- iv. Description of the added value of the Yes I Do Alliance (in comparison of not working in the partnership)

The added value of working in an alliance as opposed to working independently has been touched upon in the above sections as well. The members of the alliance are able to tap into the resources and expertise of each other's organisations as well as take advantage of each other's networks and connections. Working in an alliance allows the programme to spread its geographical outreach as different alliance members have footholds in different regions. For example, in Pakistan, Plan had a lot of experience in working in Umerkot whereas Rutgers had been in the field in Sanghar for many years. Similarly, the positioning of SAFWCO's head office in Hyderabad and its wide spectrum networks in the district allowed YID to consider interventions in Hyderabad without facing the usual barriers of entry that it would have otherwise faced.

b. Description of the collaboration with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs/Dutch Embassies

The relationship between the YIDA alliance and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Dutch Embassy in Islamabad has been positive and cordial. The management levels of the alliance partners have multiple interactions with embassy representatives on a regular basis and are up to date with each other's activities. However, it was noted that the interaction remained at the management levels and did not trickle down to YID field or programme teams who had very little interaction with the embassy. It was recognised, that there is still room for developing synergies and interaction between YIDA and the embassy. There is potential for both to benefit from each other's experiences and be more involved in each other's work in a more structured and integrated way. Furthermore, the programme would benefit substantially if the embassy were to play a role in linking the various projects and alliances that they are funding in Pakistan because they would all have the opportunity to learn from each other.

c. Description of the collaboration with other stakeholders, CM alliances, the national health system and governments

Advocacy is a major component of YIDA Pakistan's goals and objectives. In this regard, it is essential that the programme develop deep links with the above mentioned stakeholders, especially the government, if it is able to carry out its functions effectively. In order to meet its advocacy key asks, YIDA has engaged with and is a member of multiple alliances that work on Child Marriages in Pakistan. In fact, many of YIDA Pakistan's advocacy goals are addressed through its participation in alliances such as the Child Rights Movement and the Alliance Against Child Marriages.

With regard to the government, YIDA engages and collaborates with the government at multiple levels, namely the federal, provincial and district levels. Implementing partners work in continuous collaboration with the district governments of their implementing districts at every level of their programme interventions. For example, YIDA, through its advocacy efforts was able to include two Kiran Plus¹² in the district monitoring committees on SCMRA 2013 (Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013). Similarly, district education officers and other members of the administration are involved in a variety of activities and are engaged with and sensitized on the negative consequences of CM and TP.

Similarly, YIDA partners continuously engage with provincial level departments such as the department of social welfare, education and women development to not only keep them in the loop but also to find avenues of collaboration that would advance YIDA objectives. Just recently, Rutgers Pakistan was invited to be a member of a committee led by the Chief Minister's office on the inclusion of LSBE in school curriculum in Sindh.

At the federal level, YIDA cooperates with multiple ministries such as the Interior and Human Rights along with lobbying with a large spectrum of members of parliament and other elected officials. For example, YIDA Pakistan, through its alliances, lobbied parliamentarians to table a bill on raising the age of marriage for girls to 18 at the federal level. YIDA Pakistan then vigorously

¹² Kiran Plus are a group of motivated and trained adolescents who act as change agents. They are a part of the Kiran Network.

lobbied the Council of Islamic Ideology which was reviewing the bill from an Islamic standpoint. Members of the Council were introduced to Kiran Plus who advocated against CM and TP and encouraged them to pass the bill. Significant progress was made on this lobbying however due to the government's term ending and the dissolution of the parliament, the bill was scrapped with the assurance from politicians that it will be tabled again in the new parliament.

- d. Opportunities for improving the different relationships within the alliance and strengthen complementarity between the partners and with the MoFA and other alliances and stakeholders

There are multiple avenues through which the relationships between different stakeholders and alliance members can be improved. Firstly, there is a certain disconnect between the seven YID implementing countries that if improved, could have the potential to increase productivity in-country through learning and sharing of experiences. Secondly, a deeper, two way interaction between NL and YIDA Pakistan at the programmatic level would harmonise expectations and align goals and targets. At the in-country level, there are multiple opportunities for improving the relationships between YIDA and the embassy by developing relationships at all levels and trying to find synergies between YIDA and programmes funded by the Netherlands Embassy.

Lessons learned and implications for the programme 2019/2020¹³

- a. Description of top 3 main lessons learned and with explanation – these can relate to ToC, programme implementation and/or the partnership:

- What worked and why? How can other counties implement this lesson learned?

One aspect of the programme that started to show results very early on and was reflected in the mid line was the influence of trained adolescent change makers in communities and their ability to effectively spread awareness and information to many of their out of school peers, community members and policy makers. This element of empowered adolescents, trained in community mobilisation and leadership and advocacy have proven to be effective change agents. These change agents are referred to as Kiran Plus and they are a force of young boys and girls who comprise the Kiran Network. This strategy of spreading awareness and influencing change through the Kiran Plus was extremely effective and validated by the results of the mid line because of multiple factors. Firstly, the Kiran Plus are selected from a larger group of Kirans from the Yes I Do target schools on the basis of their motivation. Secondly, the Kiran Plus are from the same communities within which YIDA aims to bring about change and hence they are able to create a sense of ownership and do not face the usual barriers to entry that outsiders would. Thirdly, the strategy to consolidate their strengths in the shape of a formalized network and to assign them individual targets proved to be very fruitful as messages were being spread in an organized manner and their help was being sought where the programme felt more attention was needed. Similarly, at the policy level, Kiran Plus had a strategic advantage in gaining sympathies from government representatives and other policy makers as all were keen to hear what they had to say and were not apprehensive or suspicious of their agenda.

¹³ Source: Discussions MTR workshop

The advocacy approach adopted by YIDA Pakistan was to engage via locally based alliances such as the Child Rights Movement and the Alliance Against Child Marriage. This was a good decision because it made use of the strength of numbers and allowed YIDA Pakistan to draw upon the resources and expertise of other organisations. For example, in an effort led by Plan International, there was an effort to change the nikkah nama (marriage registration form) in Sindh to include clauses from SCMRA 2013 and list the penalties of Child Marriage. This effort was recognised by the Women Development Department Sindh and has now been taken up by the department. Similarly, through efforts via alliances, the Sindh government was lobbied to create a taskforce to include LSBE in primary school curriculum. Rutgers Pakistan is a member of that taskforce.

- What did not work and why not?

As per the TOC, the aim of creating a social movement entailed change in attitudes of parents and other gatekeepers. The findings of the mid line showed that the current engagement strategy with parents was not sufficiently bringing about a change in attitude that could really bring about a social movement. YIDA Pakistan put in place a variety of different interventions, at different levels, with different stakeholders based on the premise that these multi-faceted interventions would result in a holistic change in norms. However, one set of stakeholders i.e. parents, proved to be harder to reach than others and as the mid line showed, the inability to influence the attitudes of parents, hindered the ability of adolescents to bring about a change in norms, despite the increased awareness and access to services. It was found that in YID target areas, parents held a large amount of influence over their children's lives and were unable to make decisions without their consent and approval. Hence even though young people were aware enough to raise their voices, decision making was still difficult. The main lesson learned in this regard is that programmatic strategies need re-alignment to emphasise the role and influence of parents and that much more comprehensive engagement is required with the older generation in general by focusing on inter-generational dialogue if the YID goals are to be achieved in their true spirit.

A very important lesson learned in the implementation of the programme along with the findings of the MTR has been that an increase of knowledge amongst adolescents on SRH services coupled with intensive trainings of community based health care providers does not necessarily result in an increase in the usage of services. YIDA Pakistan focused heavily on these two components, however the link between the two remained weak and the interventions did not lead to an increase in the usage of services. In an attempt to initiate a relationship between health care providers and adolescents, YIDA Pakistan organised health sessions in target schools where all the relevant SRH information was provided in a class room setting and a relationship established wherein adolescents could visit the health care providers at their clinics for individual consultations. However, these existing services remained underutilized. This proved to be an area where current strategies were not bringing about the desired change.

Another aspect of the programme that did not go as intended was the sustainability of the school based interventions. YIDA Pakistan's WSA model entails working with a set of schools each year and ending engagement with those schools and moving to new schools the next year. Multiple structures were established in schools such as setting up YID school committees, sensitising students and staff and establishing resource centres and links with health care providers. It was intended that these structures

would sustain after the YIDA intervention ended. However, it was observed that after YIDA interventions ended at the end of the year, schools had not institutionalised or continued teaching LSBE or maintaining links with health care providers. This led to the agreement that the current model had to be revised and rather than moving to new schools it would be more beneficial to re-engage with previously targeted schools and focus on sustainability.

Provision of education and economic empowerment opportunities remained the biggest challenge in the programme operational area, mainly due to extreme under-development in the area. Poor access to education due to non-availability of school coupled with in-adequate school infrastructure is resulting in dis-continuation of education especially among girls. The issue of ghost schools remains a challenge wherein schools that exist on paper are not functioning in reality. This cause problems in planning and implementation.

Similarly, economic opportunities in terms of employment and entrepreneurship for young women and men are also quite bleak. Most of the people in the area engaged in agriculture and livestock activities. These activities are mostly unpaid especially for the girls. In the markets and close by towns, employment opportunities for girls are very limited and if there are any; girls are not encouraged to take up such opportunities due to non-conducive work environment. Similarly, the private sector is very limited and in some parts of Umerkot, non-existent. In such a setting, finding employment opportunity for trained boys and girls proved to be difficult.

b. Description of recommendations:

- What are your recommendations to improve the performance of the Yes I Do programme in your country?
- Inter-generational dialogue community dialogues are needed to enhance engagement with senior community members especially parents and to involve them in the process. Similarly, utilize resources of the existing Prevention + Programme in Sanghar by involving parents in campaigns that develop awareness about responsible fatherhood.
- Invite heads of local CSOs to sensitization workshops and urge them to incorporate YID key messages in their programming.
- Conduct a short study to answer key questions on existing SRH services, barriers to use and access. Re-strategize on the basis of the results of the study by possibly engaging with government service providers or existing private sector initiatives.
- Implement a new strategy of disseminating key messages at various youth forums (colleges, schools) in addition to door to door campaigns so that a wider audience can be reached. A sample should be monitored every quarter to ensure quality.
- Revise period of LSBE intervention from 1 year to 2-3 years to ensure sustainability beyond 2020.
- Conduct research on ghost schools to identify exactly how many schools are functional and operational in reality. Also, conduct advocacy with the district education department and initiate an enrolment campaign at community level targeting parents and community elders.
- Linking and learning from other countries such as Indonesia is required to devise a new strategy regarding what skills to teach to boys and girls (non-traditional or traditional).

- Consider revising the TOC to update it based on the legal developments that have taken place since 2016 and to focus on implementation of existing laws.
 - Enhance the role of implementing partners in advocacy at the grass roots level.
 - The PME framework needs to be revisited to assess whether certain indicators need to be revised or deleted if they cannot be operationalised or measured. The indicators should be made SMART to increase monitoring efficiency. The implementing partners role needs to be enhanced in the collecting of data and updating the framework on a regular basis.
 - The role of male Kiran Plus needs to be enhanced along with setting pre-defined ratios of how many young boys to train as change agents. There is a need to re-prioritise and enhance their participation. Additionally, there is a need to make full use of the available resources through Prevention+ in Sanghar and to integrate GBV (Gender Based Violence) messages in community sessions to address issues such as child abuse and street harassment.
 - Develop a linking and learning strategy to enhance the capacity of the programme and to learn from other countries and experiences.
 - There is a need to revisit the current YEE model given the restrictive social norms that prevent young women from seeking meaningful employment outside their homes.
- What are your recommendations to strengthen the sustainability of the programme in your country?
- Ensuring effective implementation of existing Child Marriage laws is a key factor towards sustainability. This entails working and increasing the capacity of the police, lawyers and district government in identifying and prosecuting child marriage cases.
 - There is a need to retrospectively consider the past 3 years engagements with schools and to follow up and monitor them regularly to see if YID interventions still have an impact or if re-engagement is needed. Additionally, as mentioned above, there is a need to revise school intervention period from 1 to 2-3 years to ensure sustainability past 2020.
 - Similarly, focus in the last two years of implementation should be not to spread further geographically but return to past engagements and to focus on efforts to create sustainability past 2020. For example, Youth networks such as the Kiran Network have a lot of potential and there is a need to ensure that the network is able to sustain itself past 2020. For this, resource mobilisation efforts are needed as well as training and capacity building of an executive body of the network to advocate for themselves.

Implications for the Yes I Do programme for 2019/2020¹³

e. Description of the implications for the programme implementation and partnership

The MTR process held throughout most of 2018 has allowed YIDA Pakistan to reflect on its 2.5 years of programming to consider what went well and what needs improvement. The Mid-term review conducted by KIT (Royal Tropical Institute) and YIDA Pakistan has given the Alliance both qualitative and quantitative evidence to show how all the interventions are progressing in reaching the ultimate goal and vision of YID. The report above has highlighted all the different aspects of

the programme that were deliberated upon to chart a way forward for the next two years. Challenges were highlighted, weaknesses were identified and strengths were harnessed. The MTR has resulted in multiple implications for the programme implementation, a summary of which has been presented in the lessons learned section above. In summary however, at the programmatic level, YIDA Pakistan has identified two core areas where a revision of strategies is required if the intended goal is to be achieved. The first area is the change of attitudes amongst parents and the second being the utilisation of SRH services by adolescents. Both areas have been discussed in great detail and a revised strategy has been charted out for both. In terms of engagement of parents, it has been agreed that inter-generational, community dialogues will be conducted with parents and adolescents to include them further in the process and to improve the relationships and understanding between the two groups. With reference to the utilisation of SRH services, it has been agreed to conduct a small study to identify what exactly the barriers of use are and a mapping of existing services. Based on the results of the study, a revised strategy of partnering with the public or private sector will be initiated.

Additionally, it has been acknowledged that now is the time to start focusing more attention and resources towards sustainability of YIDA interventions in Pakistan post 2020. It was identified, that many interventions, specifically the Whole School Approach (LSBE in schools) activities were not sustainable without YIDA support in their current form. Therefore, it was agreed to conduct a rigorous follow up with previously targeted schools in 2019 and identify how to ensure continuation past 2020. In this regard, at the policy level, YIDA Pakistan is engaging with the Government of Sindh to include LSBE in all government schools across the province. This would be a huge milestone in terms of sustainability.

For Pathway 4, it was observed that the lack of private sector especially in Umerkot was proving to be a hindrance in achieving YIDA goals. This was one of the factors, based on which it was decided to shift implementation from Umerkot to Hyderabad which is a major urban centre of Sindh and more viable and appropriate for this pathway. Additionally, due to restrictive norms on women mobility, women do not have the chance to gain employment. In this situation, for 2019, a new strategy needs to be developed to ensure that YIDA goals are achieved and are sustainable past 2020.

In terms of partnerships, YIDA Pakistan agreed to phase out operations from Umerkot as explained above and initiate implementation in Hyderabad from late 2018. Similarly, it has been agreed to increase the focus in Sanghar. For Hyderabad, Plan has taken on board a new implementing partner; Institute of Rural Management (IRM) which will be included into the governance structure in 2019.

f. Main conclusions for the budget 2019/2020.

On the basis of the recommendations and learnings from the MTR that have been mentioned throughout the report, many changes have been proposed for 2019 and 2020. However, the nature of the recommendations is such that they do not have radical implications on the budget due to the way it has been structured. Most changes proposed, are changes in strategy and do not add new activities to the existing workplans. Rather, they simply replace previous budgeted activities that were found to not have the impact that was desired. Additionally, in the context of Pakistan,

there is no evidence that would encourage diverting resources from one pathway to another and hence increasing or decreasing the importance given to a particular pathway. It has however been discussed and agreed that given the registration issues faced by international NGOs in Pakistan, the role of implementing partners would be enhanced and they would be more responsible for field level activities. The addition of IRM (Institute of Rural Management) as an implementing partner by Plan is an indication of the same policy. In that regard, in 2019 and 2020, many activity budgets will be shifted as they are to implementing partners.

Annex 1. Results Section

Describe per pathway (including cross-cutting issues) the level and process of change: which outcomes have been realised in the **programme implementation period of 2.5 year** and how did the outputs contribute to these outcomes. Describe whether there were any unexpected outcomes, both positive and negative (unwanted) and the challenges faced with implementation and achieving the outputs and outcomes. Highlight opportunities for improvements related to pathways.

Pathway 1: Social movement is established to transform social and gender norms that perpetuate CM & TP	
1. Which outcomes are on track? Please explain	<p>Goal 1: Social movement is established to transform social and gender norms that perpetuate CM & TP</p> <p>The 5 year target for the indicator under this outcome was to establish 10 initiatives in the local community to address CM (Child Marriage), TP (Teenage Pregnancy) and gender inequality. According to the MTR results, 3 social movement initiatives in the local community have taken place so far by the community and Kiran Plus themselves to increase awareness of girl's education and consequences of child marriages in the target areas. 2 community sessions on the harmful consequences of Child Marriages were held by community elders in Sanghar. Additionally, it was reported that a community member in Talpur village, Sanghar personally intervened and reported a child marriage and successfully delayed the marriage. In village Nizamani, a group of community members were mobilized by Kiran Plus and initiated a street theatre on SRHR and child protection. Unfortunately, no such initiative has so far been reported in Umerkot.</p> <p>Outcome 2: Community leaders, religious leaders and gate keepers understand benefits of changing norms and are aware of alternatives in relation to CM & TP</p> <p>This outcome as per the results of the midline is very much on track. The mid line has shown that after the YID intervention began, several gatekeepers in the target communities are now aware of the alternatives to Child Marriages and Teenage Pregnancies and are quite well informed about the law regarding child marriages and its penalties. Similarly, there is evidence to show that community members understand the benefits of changing norms, however these norms are quite rigid and just the recognition has not necessarily led to action on a large scale yet. YIDA is continuously engaging communities through social mobilization to explain to them the damages of child marriages.</p>

<p>2. Which outcomes are <u>not</u> on track? Please explain</p>	<p>Outcome 1: Parents, Community members and gate-keepers have changed attitudes and take action to prevent CM and TP.</p> <p>Compared to the baseline where only few gatekeepers had a positive attitude and were actively involved in preventing CM and TP, at mid line this has increased. Some gatekeepers have a positive attitude and are actively involved in preventing CM. TP is not a specific focus and is prevented by preventing child marriage as it usually occurs within marriage. So far two to four cases have been reported from YID participating villages where marriages were delayed due to efforts of youth advocates. However, impressions from the field, along with evidence from the mid line has shown that due to a certain rigidity of norms, getting community members to act against harmful practices has proven to be a challenge. Especially with reference to parents, the intended outcomes have not been reached as envisioned. Similarly, other gatekeepers such as religious leaders and community elders have not yet taken any action despite having increased awareness. In light of this, a more enhanced community engagement approach has been devised for 2019.</p>
<p>3. Are there any unexpected outcomes observed? If yes, please elaborate</p>	<p>At the time of inception, the importance of parents was understood and planned for within activities. However, after 2.5 years of implementation it has been found that parents' role was more critical than previously imagined and that without their engagement, a social movement would be impossible to create. Additionally, it was envisaged that due to a complete lack of exposure, Kiran Plus would not be as effective communicators and advocates against CM. However, after training their impact was much greater than expected.</p>
<p>4. What is/has been the contribution of the YIDA to these outcomes?</p>	<p>YIDA Pakistan began its intervention in its selected communities in late 2016 and conducted a baseline survey in the same year. Since then, the recently conducted mid line serves as a benchmark for the progress on indicators and visibly shows where and how YIDA has been able to impact change. In this regard, creating widespread awareness on the negative consequences of CM and TP through multi-pronged interventions that have been mentioned throughout this report, its alternatives and the laws surrounding are all factors where YIDA Pakistan has been able to positively contribute to the above-mentioned outcomes.</p>
<p>5. Which key outputs are realized: please provide a <u>summary</u> of key outputs and explain?</p>	<p>Output 1: Established network of change agents for social mobilization (girls, boys, men and women)</p> <p>YIDA Pakistan has worked to establish a network of change makers who would be able to advocate against CM and TP within their communities and at provincial and national policy forums. The 5</p>

	<p>year target for capacitating change makers is 1500. In this regard, so far 460 boys and girls were selected on the basis of their enthusiasm and commitment regarding the issues of CM and TP. These 460 adolescents who were called Kiran Plus were then given 2 further trainings on community mobilization and leadership and advocacy. Once trained, these Kiran Plus became the flag bearers of YID's social mobilization and advocacy efforts by leading the efforts in all regards. Kiran Plus have now been formally inducted into the Kiran Network and are members of their respective 4 district level networks as well (with the 5 year target being achieved already) These Kiran Plus have propelled the level of awareness beyond the local scale and towards the provincial level where their advocacy efforts are being acknowledged by policy makers and a large spectrum of stakeholders whose support they have successfully garnered. Additionally, Kiran Plus were each given targets of 50 peers/community members to whom they had to spread awareness about the YID issues through pre developed and specially designed toolkits. Through this activity Kiran Plus were able to reach out to over 23000 community members with the 5 year target being 600,000.</p> <p>Output 2: Improved understanding among parents, community members and CSO on disadvantages of CM and TP from social, health and legal perspectives.</p> <p>Through the indigenously designed activities YIDA Pakistan aimed to improve the understanding of parents, community members and CSOs from the target communities on issues of CM and TP and to inform them about the SCMRA 2013 and its legal implications. In these session to date, about 115 community members have been sensitised on the issues and their legal and health implications. Similar engagement was undertaken with members of local CSOs and office bearers who were sensitised. Other stakeholders were similarly engaged with individuals from media, school administrations, local government and other CSOs were given orientations on the aims and objectives of YID. This engagement took place at a multi stakeholder landscape with the attempt to engage with, sensitise and capacitate a large variety of key stakeholders at the district and village level. Similarly, religious leaders who are very influential stakeholders in the target communities were also engaged with on multiple levels. 63 religious leaders participated in consultations hosted by YID where they were sensitised on the issues and their support was garnered for the upcoming YID activities.</p>
--	--

6. How do these outputs contribute to the outcome(s)?	Improved understanding amongst community members, gatekeepers and CSOs coupled with an established network of community based change agents with targets assigned to them result in raising widespread awareness and eventually community members taking action to rid themselves of harmful practices such as CM and TP.
7. Which outputs were <u>not</u> realized? Please provide a summary and explain	N/A
8. What are the challenges and opportunities to improve outcomes of pathway 1?	Within this pathway, it was identified that there is a need to increase and upscale the engagement with religious leaders by the programme team to be able to create a stronger impact. Similarly, in order to reach the ultimate goal of Pathway 1, it has been identified that more efforts are required to engage with community members and gatekeepers, especially parents. In this regard, a community based dialogue approach has been agreed upon to further enhance the ownership of community members in the process to be able to create a social movement.
Pathway 2: Adolescent girls and boys are meaningfully engaged to claim their SRHR	
1. Which outcomes are on track? Please explain	<p>Goal 2: Adolescent girls and boys are meaningfully engaged to claim their SRH rights</p> <p>Of the 14,404 adolescent boys and girls who have been capacitated on LSBE in schools so far, 80% have reported increased knowledge. Adolescents are meaningfully engaged in all levels of YIDA decision making and are an integral part of the governance structures. Mechanisms are in place to ensure meaningful youth participation and are structurally involved in programming, PME, Planning and implementation. 75% of young people were found to be satisfied with their role and thought that their contribution was meaningful and valued.</p> <p>Outcome 1: CSO ensure established safe spaces are utilized (platforms, forums, channels) by adolescent and young people</p> <p>Under this outcome, the mid line showed that schools under the YID intervention were a safe space for adolescent girls and boys where they were able to discuss otherwise taboo topics and get SRHR information. Additionally, it was ensured that trained adolescents were provided opportunities and forums where they would not only be given exposure and learning experiences but would be able to advocate for their causes themselves and bring about sustainable change in their lives and in lives of others. In this</p>

	<p>regard, Kiran Plus and other YIDA youth advocates were given a voice at YIDA platforms and were meaningfully engaged in decision making platforms. Similarly, other appropriate forums were highlighted where YIDA trained adolescents were able to participate. In addition to private forums, Kiran Plus were enabled to engage with policy makers at the provincial level and select number of Kiran Plus were made a part of district level monitoring committees that had been notified by the government of Sindh to ensure the effective implementation of SCMRA 2013. However, the MTR data found that so far only few girls and boys felt comfortable discussing SRH issue in safe spaces. The aim for 2020 is for most girls and boys to feel comfortable.</p> <p>Outcome 2: CSOs are involving young people in their programming in a meaningful way</p> <p>YIDA Pakistan has attempted to integrate meaningful youth participation in its programming as well as aim to integrate it into the programming of local CSOs. At the YIDA level, youth advocates especially Kiran Plus have been a part of the YIDA governing bodies and have an integral role in decision making at the output level and in the long term planning. Similarly, the local implementing partner has ensured a similar output at the field level where Kiran Plus have been trained and mentored in a way that they are now leading multiple activities in the field. This was reflected in the MTR data where all 3 partners scored relatively high (above 4 out of 5) in the MYP checklist. However, the extent of change perceived by young people in their experience that their contribution was meaningful and valued did not increase from base line to mid line.</p> <p>Outcome 3: Adolescent girls and boys are aware of their rights and are empowered to raise their voices</p> <p>After being sensitized on SRHR, LSBE and having their capacity developed on areas of community mobilization and advocacy, Kiran Plus were aware of their rights and were in a position to raise their voices within their communities and at different relevant forums. the trained Kirans and Kiran Plus have reached a level of confidence where they are able to venture beyond their schools and communities and are able to represent their peers at a variety of different platforms and are able to advocate for the issues that they believe in. Kiran Plus, both boys and girls have been able to present their case in front of policy makers and have been able to travel across the country to attend events and workshops where they have been able to not only learn but share their own experiences. Similarly, Kiran Plus have been able to arrange and initiate</p>
--	--

	community based theatres in which their dramatic performances enlightened community members on the evils of child marriages and the importance of girls education. The MTR data reflected that level of awareness increased from low to somewhat in 2.5 years. The mid line also showed that although young people can advocate for themselves, especially if they are directly involved in YIDA activities, they still have difficulties being heard by elders.
2. Which outcomes are <u>not</u> on track? Please explain	Both outcomes under this pathway are on track.
3. Are there any unexpected outcomes observed? If yes, please elaborate	N/A
4. What is/has been the contribution of the YIDA to these outcomes?	YIDA Pakistan has worked intimately with schools through the Whole School Approach which has shown visible results in that these schools are considered safe spaces for adolescents. The establishment of the Kiran Network has provided a channel wherein adolescents boys and girls are actively participating in forums across the country to raise awareness about the negative consequences of child marriage. Similarly, the widespread dissemination of SRHR information through Roshan Rahain (indigenously developed Life skills Based Education Manual taught in target schools) and other toolkits have created awareness amongst the youth about their rights.
5. Which key outputs are realized: please provide a <u>summary</u> of key outputs and explain?	<p>Output 1: CSOs have been capacitated in SRHR and working with young people</p> <p>Capacity building of CSOs (YIDA partners including SAFWCO, Rutgers and Plan) has been a core focus of YID. 12 staff members working in the field and in the implementation areas were capacitated on issues surrounding SRHR, meaningful youth participation and the aims and objectives of YID. The 5 year target being 25. This proved to be extremely beneficial as those staff members interacting with adolescents and community members were sensitized on the topics and were able to implement the programme efficiently and effectively. Similarly, a pool of master trainers was developed who would then train Kiran Plus on community mobilization and leadership and advocacy. This pool of trainers is a valuable asset that includes some senior Kiran Plus as well who have achieved a level of success in mentoring and are now certified trainers. These Master trainers hail from a wide spectrum of fields and all belong to the target districts. As some work in different local CSOs, they are able to inculcate their learnings in their respective organizations as well.</p>

	<p>Output 2: Adolescent girls and boys have skills for influencing quality service provision</p> <p>YID aims to not only improve the knowledge of boys and girls on SRHR, rather it focuses strongly on improving the skills of adolescents so that they are in a position to influence quality service provision in their communities. This includes capacity building on community mobilisation, leadership and advocacy as well as increasing their technical know-how on SRHR, hygiene, economic empowerment and basic legal frameworks including rights and most importantly the law on SCMRA 2013 and its legal implications. These skills once taught have been utilised by Kiran Plus and other youth advocates in community mobilisation, creating awareness amongst community members and asking for their rights from local stakeholders. Similarly, these skills have been used by Kiran Plus to advocate against child marriages and ask for increased and more effective implementation of the law by engaging with provincial and national policy makers. So far 14,404 adolescent boy and girls have participated in SRHR education session and awareness raising activities i.e. studied Roshan Rahain. The 5 year target is 30,000. However, it was found that adolescents skills were not being utilized to advocate or demand for quality SRH services.</p> <p>Output 3: Adolescent girls and boys have improved knowledge on their SRHR</p> <p>A variety of activities have been initiated in both schools and communities to improve the knowledge of adolescent boys and girls on SRHR. In schools, the indigenously developed 'Roshan Rahain' book that has detailed information on SRHR has been taught to over 14,404 boys and girls who are known as Kirans by their teachers. 80% (11,523) of targeted adolescent girls and boys have reported to have improved knowledge on SRHR. These Kirans, equipped with their improved knowledge and specially designed toolkits have gone in the communities to improve the knowledge on SRHR of there out of school peers. Similarly, sessions were held in the communities on SRHR and meaningful youth participation. Different and innovative methods were utilised to engage adolescents and to create more awareness. Interactive theatres were arranged in communities that were designed to entertain, involve and create awareness about the importance of girl's education and the harms of child marriages. Another effort of engagement and improving knowledge was made through sports. Cricket tournaments and other co-curricular activities were arranged in target districts where key messages of awareness were</p>
--	--

	disseminated to participating adolescents and community members along with members of district administration and the media.
6. How do these outputs contribute to the outcome(s)?	Improving the knowledge of adolescent girls and boys on SRHR, providing them with the skills to influence quality service provision and creating an environment amongst CSOs and other locally based entities contribute effectively towards the empowerment of adolescents to collectively raise their voices and to be able to effectively utilize forums and platforms where they are able to not only learn but raise awareness about the issues that they are fighting for.
7. Which outputs were <u>not</u> realized? Please provide a summary and explain	All outputs are currently on track.
8. What are the challenges and opportunities to improve outcomes of pathway 2?	Although much was done under this pathway to engage with adolescents in a variety of meaningful ways, it was agreed that adolescents should be provided more exposure and co-curricular opportunities both in and out of their communities. This would go a long way in enhancing the empowerment of adolescents. Additionally, it was noted that a challenge for MYP is also that young people feel empowered to raise their voice, but not yet to make decisions for e.g. the MTR showed that adolescents despite awareness were beholden to the wishes of their parents.
Pathway 3: Adolescent girls and boys take informed action on their sexual health	
1. Which outcomes are on track? Please explain	<p>Goal 3: Adolescent girls and boys take informed action on their sexual and reproductive health and rights</p> <p>From the 14,404 adolescents capacitated on LSBE in schools, 1,750 girls and boys (age 15-24) voluntarily went and received individual counselling sessions in schools on menstrual health, puberty and body changes through trained healthcare providers where their confidentiality and privacy were protected. The 5 year target is set at 12,000.</p> <p>Outcome 2: Increased quality of ASRHR and social welfare information and services</p> <p>After receiving training on how to provide youth friendly health services, health care providers from targeted communities are giving health sessions in schools to adolescents who had been previously provided LSBE information by YID. These health sessions are given with the aim of providing adolescents with better quality SRHR information and by establishing a referral mechanism</p>

	<p>between adolescents and health care providers. Similarly, teachers trained on LSBE by master trainers then went on to disseminate LSBE information through pre developed curriculums (Roshan Rahain) to 14,404 adolescents from target schools. The mid line showed that adolescents have benefitted from health sessions held in schools and as compared to the baseline, increased quality of ASRHR and social welfare information is available. In the baseline the score of targeted health facilities providing youth friendly health services was 2.67 in Sanghar and 2.17 in Umerkot. The midline showed that the scores had increased to 2.98 in Sanghar and 2.58 in Umerkot. This showed a slight improvement however this is not a significant change and this too is mostly the result of trainings provided by YIDA to health care</p>
<p>2. Which outcomes are <u>not</u> on track? Please explain</p>	<p>Outcome 1: Adolescent girls and boys are increasingly accessing ASRHR information and services and child protection services</p> <p>The mid line found that young people (especially those in school) have much more access to SRHR information through Yes I Do-through which trainings are given. Due to this, teachers are also to some extent talking about it more openly and giving SRHR-related education. Print and electronic media are not used as widely due to low literacy levels and common sources of information are peers or friends. Young women also approach their mothers and female family members especially if they are married or out-of-school. This information seems to focus on the negative effects of child marriage, birth spacing (after marriage) to some extent and puberty-related issues like menstruation. A wide spectrum of activities were conducted to ensure that adolescents from the target districts accessed SRHR information and services and that they had access to said information. Pre developed key messages advocating against CM and TP and those in favour of girls education were continuously broadcast on local radio stations with a potential outreach of 1.5 million people. Similarly, SRHR information was telecast on a local tv show that was led by trained Kiran Plus themselves. A music video featuring Kiran Plus was developed to highlight the issues faced by communities and adolescents as a result of child marriages and is serving as a motivational tool to highlight the efforts by YIDA in Umerkot and Sanghar. Co-curricular activities were organised in schools and were open to outsiders to utilise innovative methods of disseminating SRHR information to community members and amongst younger school children. Material developed in these activities was used at different platforms to create and spread awareness on key issues. Medicinal camps were established to raise awareness for mothers and children on SRHR and increase access to information and LWH home visits were organised. Similarly, to ensure sustainability of the</p>

	<p>Programme within schools, YID school committees were established in target schools which consisted of a wide range of key stakeholders and aimed to oversee YID activities in schools and to ensure joint collaborative efforts in making sure that the aims of the YID Programme were sustained independently after the end of YID interventions. Additionally, 14,404 in-school Kirans have been provided with specially designed toolkits and were given targets of 10 out of school peers each whom they had to engage with to provide them with SRHR information. Along with these toolkits, a variety of IEC material has been developed that could be used to increase the outreach and access of SRHR information to a large percentage of community members and to highlight YID efforts at a policy level. However, despite many interventions, it was found that in terms of SRH services specifically, adolescents very rarely accessing these services, in fact It was reported that only 5% young people were satisfied with the existing ASRHR services. It was also reported that very few adolescents were actually utilizing these services due to multiple issues such as disapproval from parents, mobility, and social norms.</p>
3. Are there any unexpected outcomes observed? If yes, please elaborate	<p>It was observed that despite multiple interventions, young people despite being aware and an existing pool of trained HCP, young people were still not visiting these health facilities due to multiple factors mentioned above. Additionally, it seems that other than YIDA interventions, HCPs (Health care providers) are not self-motivated to make changes to become more youth friendly.</p>
4. What is/has been the contribution of the YIDA to these outcomes?	<p>The mid line results showed that YIDA Pakistan has had a contribution in increasing the access to information and services in the target districts. Similarly, the results showed that due to the YIDA interventions, quality of services has also slightly increased due to the training/sensitisation of health care providers and teachers. providers and not initiatives by the health care providers themselves.</p>
5. Which key outputs are realized: please provide a <u>summary</u> of key outputs and explain?	<p>Output 1: Adolescent girls and boys have skills for influencing quality service provision</p> <p>Since this output is also identically reflected in pathway 2 and contributes to both pathways, it is being copied from pathway 2 above as follows. YID aims to not only improve the knowledge of boys and girls on SRHR, rather it focuses strongly on improving the skills of adolescents so that they are in a position to influence quality service provision in their communities. This includes capacity building on community mobilisation, leadership and advocacy as well as increasing their technical know-how on SRHR, hygiene, economic empowerment and basic legal frameworks including rights and most importantly the law on SCMRA 2013 and</p>

	<p>its legal implications. These skills once taught have been utilised by youth advocates in community mobilisation, creating awareness amongst community members and asking for their rights from local stakeholders. Similarly, these skills have been used by Kiran Plus to advocate against child marriages and ask for increased and more effective implementation of the law by engaging with provincial and national policy makers. So far 14,404 adolescent boy and girls have participated in SRHR education session and awareness raising activities i.e. Roshan Rahain. The 5 year target is 30,000. However, it was found that adolescents skills were not being utilized to advocate or demand for quality SRH services.</p> <p>Output 2: Adolescent girls and boys have improved knowledge on their SRHR</p> <p>This output is also reflected under pathway 2 as it contributes to both pathways equally and therefore the following has been copied from pathway 2 as follows. A variety of activities have been initiated in both schools and communities to improve the knowledge of adolescent boys and girls on SRHR. In schools, the indigenously developed 'Roshan Rahain' book that has detailed information on SRHR has been taught to over 14,404 boys and girls who are known as Kirans by their teachers. 80% (11,523) of targeted adolescent girls and boys have reported to have improved knowledge on SRHR. These Kirans, equipped with their improved knowledge and specially designed toolkits have gone in the communities to improve the knowledge on SRHR of there out of school peers. Similarly, sessions were held in the communities on SRHR and meaningful youth participation. Different and innovative methods were utilised to engage adolescents and to create more awareness. Interactive theatres were arranged in communities that were designed to entertain, involve and create awareness about the importance of girls education and the harms of child marriages. Another effort of engagement and improving knowledge was made through sports. Cricket tournaments and other co-curricular activities were arranged in target districts where key messages of awareness were disseminated to participating adolescents and community members along with members of district administration and the media.</p> <p>Output 3: Teachers, health and social workers are better equipped to provide ASRHR information and services to provide safe and youth friendly spaces</p>
--	---

	<p>The activities under this output set the foundation for the work carried out by YID under the Whole School Approach. Master trainers were trained on LSBE and on the Rutgers LSBE curriculum in particular. These master trainers went on to train male and female teachers from the targeted schools of where a total of 14,404 male and female students were targeted for dissemination of the LSBE education. Additionally, health care providers from nearby areas were targeted and given orientations on YID and trained on how to provide youth friendly health services. So far 138 teachers, health and social workers and peer educators have been trained in detection and prevention of CM and TP. For 2020 the target is 300.</p>
6. How do these outputs contribute to the outcome(s)?	<p>The above mentioned outputs focus on enhancing skills and improving knowledge of adolescents on SRHR along with equipping teachers, health care providers and social workers with the technical know-how with which they can provide better ASRHR services and safe spaces. Engaging with these communities based stakeholders increases the access of information to adolescents and increases the quality of the services provided.</p>
7. Which outputs were <u>not</u> realized? Please provide a summary and explain	<p>All outputs are on track however there is still a lot of work to be done in Output 3 in terms of getting adolescents to utilize the available youth friendly health services.</p>
8. What are the challenges and opportunities to improve outcomes of pathway 3?	<p>As mentioned above, both impressions from the field along with the results of the mid line have shown a weak link between health care providers and adolescents. Although the dissemination of information in-schools is effective, the reach out of adolescents to health care centres is weak. The MTR workshop strategized on methods to improve this link in 2019.</p>
Pathway 4: Adolescent & young women have alternatives beyond CM and TP through education and socio economic empowerment.	
1. Which outcomes are on track? Please explain	<p>Goal 4: Adolescent & young women have alternatives beyond CM and TP through education and socio-economic empowerment.</p> <p>The MTR data shows that so far 8% of graduates (boys and girls) of technical and vocational training were engaged in income generation work within 6 months of finishing the training. The 5 year goal is 30%.</p> <p>Outcome 1: Adolescent girls finish secondary education</p> <p>To encourage girls' education, Scholarship for Girls were distributed so that girls could continue secondary/higher secondary education. For this, School management committees were formed. Plan</p>

	<p>International Project staff conducted meetings with Education department, school management committees, for the disbursement of scholarships. 463 Scholarships were disbursed among girls of three schools. The schools included one from Umerkot and two from district Sanghar. Additionally, all the activities listed under this pathway that aim to provide girls and boys with alternatives beyond CM and TP through economic empowerment along with the activities listed under the other pathways have created an environment in the target communities wherein the importance of girls education is starting to gain traction. Initial monitoring probes have shown that there is an increased awareness amongst community members, especially elders on allowing girls to complete their education. In one particular case, a young girl who has been victim of a child marriage is now a Kiran and has returned to school to advocate against the practice. The Sindh education profile reveals that 22% of boys and 27% of girls in Umerkot dropped out of school while 12% of boys and 17% of girls dropped out in Sanghar.</p> <p>Outcome 2: Young women and adolescent girls are more economically empowered</p> <p>Primarily the organization of Meena bazars (Markets set up by boys and girls in schools where they sell home made goods to community members) by SAFWCO and career counseling sessions by Plan in the schools were extremely productive and beneficial for the adolescents, school administrations and communities as a whole in creating awareness about the importance of pursuing economic opportunities and its empowering impact on youth especially young women. These bazaars allowed girls and boys an avenue and platform to use their creativity to develop items that they could sell to generate income. This activity allowed them to realise their potential to contribute to their families' income. Similarly, since these events were often coupled with celebration of international days, they were open events where parents and community members were welcomed and given the opportunity to witness the potential economic benefits of educating their daughters and the negative consequences of early marriages. These meena bazars were often supplemented with IEC material that highlighted the economic role of girls and women and the value of participatory decision making amongst families. This activity allowed young girls to realize the potential economic contribution they could make to their households, it also allowed parents to realize the importance of girls from an economic perspective and regarding their continued education. Additionally, to ensure that girls have alternatives beyond CM and TP, Plan</p>
--	--

	<p>international Pakistan used its expertise of Youth Economic Empowerment (YEE) Program to analyze the situation by conducting a market scan. The scan provided a detailed analysis about the sort of skilled labour force and need for new trainings needed in the area and how employability for the graduates of technical and vocational skill training institutes may be ensured. In order to give more guidance to the adolescents/youth career counseling and work force development sessions were conducted. Trained staff provided information helped adolescent girls and youth to look out for options in terms of continuation of education and/or attain technical and vocational skills which may be help them to earn decent livelihood and avoid early marriage.</p> <p>On the basis of market scan it was discovered that skill development of adolescent girls on local embroidery and stitching (sewing clothes) can help them to develop small enterprises and earn decent livelihood. It was also noted that adolescent girls cannot buy necessary equipment to start their enterprises. Plan International Pakistan in addition to supporting them to attain technical and vocational skills but also provided the passed out graduates with toolkits so that poor/marginalized adolescents can start their own enterprises or jobs. These efforts paid back as it is reported they adolescent girls gone through training program are generating income by jump-starting their home based enterprises. All these factors are contributing to an environment where girls and young women are becoming more economically empowered to pursue career options and with time this sentiment will grow. Of 32 women interviewed in the MTR, 70% of young women reported to be involved in income generation activities at household level.</p> <p>Outcome 3: Increased retention to safe secondary education for adolescent girls and child protection school systems are in place</p> <p>According to the mid line, all participants considered schools safe. However, once married, if young women go to school, they are bullied and harassed by peers due to their marital status. Although schools were considered safe, some mentioned that girls and young women face sexual and verbal harassment on their way to school. As part of the programme activities, resource centres were set up in all schools that operate as safe spaces for school children where they would be able to find literature on the value of economic empowerment and the disadvantages of early marriages and pregnancies. As discussed above, scholarships for 463 girls were disbursed to increase school retention. Similarly, YID school committees were established in all schools with a wide range of stakeholders that were put in place to increase retention, provide a safe environment and increase child protection systems in</p>
--	---

	<p>schools. YID committees are comprised of School head, Teacher and community members, they work alongside for the betterment of the schools. YID school committees especially teachers attend trainings organized by project on the issues around SRHR, CM and TP. The Gender parity index shows that in Umerkot: 0.7062 and Sanghar: 0.6754 girls have more access & retention over boys. The value less than 1 indicates disparity in favor of girls.</p> <p>Outcome 4: Increased access to credits and jobs and control over economic activities for young women (18+)</p> <p>Activities such as linking youth with MFIs (Micro Finance Institutions), Provision of information on loan products, trainings (vocational), and tool kit provision for self-employment, Career Counseling and work force development sessions are the efforts aimed to increase access of youth to credits, jobs and entrepreneurship for youth especially young women. In this regard, employers mapping is an on-going activity, with the objective to link adolescents/youth to provide on hand trainings through internships and attachments. The biggest achievement under this output is that after getting training from tailoring center five trained girls were given opportunity of attachment as a co-trainer in the training sessions of tailoring at Umerkot District where as two trained graduates obtained the opportunity of attachment as co trainer in District Sanghar. It is aimed that this access will continue to increase through a continued process of linking employers with young women from the target communities</p>
2. Which outcomes are <u>not</u> on track? Please explain	<p>Increased access to credits and jobs remained a biggest challenge. The economy of the area does not have the capacity to absorb and provide employment opportunities to the young girls. MFI always consider youth a risky client due to fact that they don't have to offer any collateral. No youth friendly loan products are available, at the same time young girls remains fearful in have loan facility that in an economy where situation is not very encouraging will they be able to pay back or not.</p> <p>Increasing girls' enrolment and preventing dropout especially after primary school is also a challenge. Highlighting the importance of education is integral part of social mobilization activity. Ghost schools, Poverty, mobility of girls from one village to secondary schools are the major causes of drop out after the completion of primary education.</p>
3. Are there any unexpected outcomes observed? If yes, please elaborate	<p>The program is a success in demonstrating that vocational trainings can play a vital role and young girls can earn by self-employment. They can adopt local products making as profession and market</p>

	<p>them through the organized youth forums. It is observed that adolescent girls are now taking steps and finding way out to reach out to such activities.</p>
<p>4. What is/has been the contribution of the YIDA to these outcomes?</p>	<p>YIDA program made a real difference in awareness raising among masses especially adolescent girls to the extent that they can be economically empowered and better off by learning income generating skills. Participating adolescent girls are of the view that if they can't attain formal employment even then they have the chance to earn some livelihood by working at home. This can make difference to their economic wellbeing and girls position get better. Continuation of education is also an important objective of the YIDA. 463 scholarships, school kits and awareness raising through social mobilization efforts are made to make communities realize how education can help them to economically empowered. It was observed that communities do have realization on this.</p>
<p>5. Which key outputs are realized: please provide a <u>summary</u> of key outputs and explain?</p>	<p>Output 1: Increased provision of youth friendly micro finance services</p> <p>As access to financial resources is important to start an enterprise, mapping of MFIs in the implementation area was conducted. 4 MFIs (TRDP, NRSP, Telenor and Khushhali MF Bank) were engaged. These MFIs conducted fourteen sessions in all 14 project intervention communities in which information on available products was given to 107 young boys and 194 girls. This information is disseminated within youth so that they could benefit from the MFI products. One day district level consultative dialogue with MFIs and Stakeholders on youth friendly microfinance was organized in Umerkot in which a large number of trained girls from project areas and representatives of civil society organizations, Government officials participated and shared their ideas regarding youth friendly loans. Similarly, Plan International conducted a research study on youth friendly loan product, under its Youth Economic Empowerment project, in Chakwal (funded by Finland National Office). Through this, close links were developed with MFIs. Plan International, through its implementing partner IRM is trying to convince MFIs to introduce youth friendly loan products in YID programme areas. So far 7 MFIs have been sensitized on youth friendly micro finance services. The 5 year target is 10.</p> <p>Output 2: Established collaboration with private sector</p> <p>YIDA is establishing collaboration with the private sector so that trainees may be able to secure apprenticeship/internship or employment opportunities. Brighter light (A Norwegian company-deal in solar panels) was reached and trained youth were referred to secure internship/employment. In Sanghar different beautician</p>

	<p>parlours were reached and linked with youth trainees for internship purposes. We are continuously engaging private employers and MFIs to support adolescent girls/youth for employment/self-employment. Additionally, so far, 2636 girls have participated in career counselling sessions out of the 5 year target of 15,000.</p> <p>Output 3: Youth led groups aged 13-17 and 18-24 are functional/operational</p> <p>40 Youth led groups of both Plan international Pakistan and Rutgers/SAFWCO have been initiated and are operational and functioning. The target is to have 100 such groups by 2020. Plan International Pakistan youth groups are community based. Their prime objective is to raise awareness among communities on the dangers of child marriage and awareness on alternate choices such as education and economic empowerment. Plan International Pakistan so far organized 35 youth forums in project area. The youth are engaged in different activities which help to raise awareness about various professions and economic choices including on the issues around child marriage and teenage pregnancy. Extra-curricular activities such as cricket matches, celebration of holi (Hindu festival) and international days and regular community meetings are tools used to achieve this objective.</p> <p>In fact, other than community mobilization and advocacy, members of these youth groups such as the Kiran Network are now leading multiple YIDA activities in the field and are involved in the planning and decision making process.</p>
6. How do these outputs contribute to the outcome(s)?	<p>Provision of technical trainings (short duration and vocational), information about financial services and provision of toolkits to kick start their own enterprises really contributed towards YIDA Path way 4. Adolescent girls are much more aware of the importance of economic activities and education. Provision of Scholarships to 463 students helped to continue their education. Poverty in the area is so deep rooted; sometimes parents even can't afford to buy School books and stationary for their kids to learn. YIDA consider the requirement and provided with necessary stationary which resulted in good learning environment.</p>
7. Which outputs were <u>not</u> realized? Please provide a summary and explain	<p>Collaboration with private sector remains a biggest challenge for YIDA. There were not many employers who could provide job opportunities to the adolescent girls. For example, Brighter Light, a Norwegian company that deals with Solar Panel was willing to work with YIDA and its economic empowerment initiatives. However, Brighter Light had to wrap up its operations and leave because of a lack of customers in the area who could pay for their services.</p>

	<p>Umerkot, with very poor economic activities in the districts remained the biggest challenge. Employment opportunities are non-existent, so linking adolescent girls and young women with employer and connecting them with employment opportunities were very hard. Considering the fact, project relocation was recommended.</p>
<p>8. What are the challenges and opportunities to improve outcomes of pathway 4?</p>	<p>Challenges:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <p>1. Economic Situation/local economy</p> <p>Pakistan remains one of the lowest performers in the South Asia Region on human development indicators, especially in education and stunting. Gender disparities persist in education, health and all economic sectors. Poor economic growth leads to very few employment opportunities, particularly for women. This phenomenon put them in vicious trap of poverty.</p> <p>2. Girls Mobility</p> <p>Social norms against women coming into close contact with unrelated men, and the discomfort, social stigma, and fear of harassment, limits women's movement. This constrains their choices to participate in the labour force, continue their education, or engage in other independent activities. In some areas even like Umerkot public transport facility is missing or very limited so this is very tough for young girls to move around and look for opportunities.</p> <p>3. Acceptance of girls as employees/workers</p> <p>YIDA program is focusing on the empowerment of adolescent girls. It is very unfortunate that Pakistan has one of the lowest female labour force participation rates in South Asia. Women especially young girls are not encouraged to be part of labour force. There are issues related to women/young girls' employability. It is considered that they are less productive, extra measures such as ensuring their safety (sexual harassment) becomes a challenge so they are not welcomed in labour force. In areas like Umerkot and Sanghar, very few job opportunities are available.</p> <p>Opportunity:</p> <p>Given the restricted environment and the limited possibility of women leaving their homes, it is difficult to promote economic empowerment with the current YEE model. Hence the strategy needs to be revisited. More</p>

	<p>innovative approaches such as local vegetable shops through the products of kitchen gardening and linkage with Sindh education foundation for teaching employability have to be explored.</p> <p>There are also efforts on other solutions such as group enterprises, and convincing employers to consider adolescent girls who are trained under Yes I Do. Driving is under consideration and we are in negotiation with UBER/CAREEM to hire them as drivers. I think in this way we are trying to produce better results and girls get more autonomy and may become role model for others.</p>
Pathway 5: Policy makers and duty bearers develop and implement laws and policies on CM and FGM	
1. Which outcomes are on track? Please explain	<p>Goal 5: Policy makers and duty bearers develop, reforms and implement policies as well as enforce laws on CM and TP</p> <p>In Sindh, in addition to the Child Marriage Restraint Act (SCMRA 2013) a historic bill related to Hindu marriages was passed by the Provincial assembly in 2016. Additionally, the rules of business for SCMRA were promulgated in 2016. YIDA Pakistan's efforts resulted in encouraging the Sindh government to revise the Nikkah Nama (Marriage Registration Form) and include the penalties of child marriages on the form. That recommendation was approved by the Women Development department and is currently in process. Most recently, the Sindh Government initiated a task force of which Rutgers is a member that aimed to incorporate LSBE into school curriculums. Implementation of these existing laws and rules is still relatively weak. The MTR data was a reflection on that finding wherein 0 activities have been initiated by the government on CM and TP. The target for 2020 was 5.</p> <p>Outcome 1: Socio-political awareness increased and political will is created</p> <p>YIDA Pakistan has made multiple efforts through its membership of the Child Rights Movement and the Alliance Against Child Marriages in Sindh, Punjab and the federal territories to push for better implementation of SCMRA 2013 and the raising of the marriage age for girls in Punjab and at the federal level. These continued efforts have seen political will being created in trying to pass legislation that would increase the age of marriage to 18 at the federal level. The bill was under review in the previous parliament and many legislators have promised to table it again in the new</p>

	<p>parliament. Similarly, efforts in election season by the alliances were able to include child rights in the manifestos of every major political party.</p> <p>Outcome 2: CSO networks and change makers hold the government, policy bearers to account</p> <p>Since the launch of the Kiran Network, Kiran Plus have met with multiple government level stakeholders and advocated for increased and more effective implementation of the SCMRA 2013. These efforts have resulted in 2 Kiran Plus from Sanghar being officially appointed as members of Sindh Government sanctioned district monitoring committee on child marriages. YIDA through its adolescent change makers and its memberships of a large variety of rights forums has been attempting to hold the policy makers to account on child marriage related legislation and legal implementation. This is a continued effort that YIDA continues to pursue in the ever changing political landscape on multiple fronts.</p>
2. Which outcomes are <u>not</u> on track? Please explain	All outcomes are on track; however, a new party has just taken reigns of the government and their policies are still unfolding. Even though their manifesto was very progressive in terms of child's rights, it is still to be seen how their policies unfold. In that scenario, advocacy in this current climate is very fluid and it remains to be seen how effective advocacy efforts are in this regard. Additionally, the element of implementation of existing laws is still very weak and it has been agreed that YIDA Pakistan needs to re-focus its attention to ensuring effective implementation.
3. Are there any unexpected outcomes observed? If yes, please elaborate	N/A
4. What is/has been the contribution of the YIDA to these outcomes?	YIDA Pakistan's partner organizations are core members of alliances working for child rights. Evidence has shown that joint advocacy efforts have been more fruitful and therefore YIDA aims to work through its alliances to benefit from its support. Additionally, YIDA Pakistan has taken the lead on advocacy efforts at the provincial level in Sindh where the aim has been to improve implementation of the existing child marriage law (SCMRA). YIDA change makers (Kiran Plus) have also led efforts in this regard, contributing positively to the outcomes.
5. Which key outputs are realized: please provide a <u>summary</u> of key outputs and explain?	<p>Output 1: Enhanced evidence based advocacy</p> <p>In Sindh, efforts have been made to update the Nikkah Nama (marriage certificate), to bring it in line with SCMRA 2013. Additionally, one core task under this output has been to advocate</p>

	<p>for budgetary allocation for the implementation of SCMRA 2013. Similarly, comprehensive training/sessions were planned through the programme duration, to raise awareness on SCMRA 2013 and rules of business 2016, for SCMRA 2013. Plan International printed 6000 copies for mass dissemination for rules of business 2016, for SCMRA 2013.</p> <p>Additionally, at the provincial level, Rutgers Pakistan and SAFWCO have held sensitization workshops and sessions with a large spectrum of stakeholders to sensitise them on the issues of child marriages, teenage pregnancies and the need for life skills based education in schools. So far over 50,000 media hits have been achieved on evidence based advocacy. The aim is 150,000.</p> <p>Output 2: Research conducted and data acquired for advocacy purposes</p> <p>Rutgers Pakistan has made efforts to provide evidence based research to policy makers in Sindh to ensure more stringent implementation of SCMRA 2013. This has been done by having research conducted that is the first of its kind and after its launch will be disseminated widely to support policy makers in identifying gaps within the system. This research studies SCMRA 2013 and how it's been implemented so far and identifies the gaps and flaws in the law and the implementation of it. In Punjab, YIDA alliance has made great efforts to advocate and lobby for increasing the age of girl child, for marriage, from 16 years of age to 18 years. YIDA has also joined hands with Child rights movement (CRM) to achieve this key advocacy task. 12 case studies documenting best practices have been documented so far and the 5 year target was 10. However, 0 communication materials have been developed so far based on findings from the mid line.</p>
6. How do these outputs contribute to the outcome(s)?	Acquiring data, conducting research and proactively pursuing an evidence based advocacy strategy contributes effectively towards empowering change makers and CSOs in holding policy makers accountable. Similarly, these outputs help create socio economic awareness and generate political will to work towards the eradication of harmful social norms.
7. Which outputs were <u>not</u> realized? Please provide a summary and explain	All outputs are on track.
8. What are the challenges and opportunities to improve outcomes of pathway 5?	There needs to be a shift from advocacy for creation of laws towards the implementation of laws, at least in Sindh province. The major hurdle at this point in time in reducing child marriages is the strict enforcement of the law by the police and judicial system that

	is either unaware of the new law or does not act firmly enough. In this regard, enhanced sensitization along with advocacy is required.
Cross-cutting issues Which the results have been achieved concerning the following cross-cutting issues: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Gender transformative approach Girls empowerment Men & boys engagement Meaningful Youth Participation 	
Gender transformative approach: <i>describe status of GTA at the start of the programme and the current status of the programme</i>	Gender Transformative approach is considered a priority area when implementing the YID Programme. GTA at the time of inception of Yes I Do was a relatively new concept with little understanding in the field. Since then however, many efforts have been made to not only create awareness but incorporate GTA in all levels of planning. All the trainings provided to partner's staff, HCPs, Kiran Plus include sessions and content on GTA. The materials developed for LSBE, Kirans Plus toolkits, peer education tools etc. contains messages on Gender and GTA and are continuously reviewed from a GTA lens to ensure that it is reflected appropriately at the country level as well as the partner level. However, rural communities in district Umerkot and Sanghar largely do not allow socializing of young women and men, under one roof, because it is not considered appropriate under the cultural norms and values of the area. To address this issue following strategies were practiced so that girls and boys may enjoy equal opportunities and meaningful participation in YID. Firstly, separate youth forums' were formed, consisting of boys and girls, at village level, ensuring that there is an equal membership of girls and boys in youth forums. Similarly, separate capacity building sessions are held for boys and girls. In case of girls, family members are allowed to accompany them to the training venues, which give them a sense of security. Separate youth forums have encouraged girls to participate in the project activities, at their convenience. In future this will also help more girls to have access to vocational, life skills and enterprise development trainings so that they can engage in income generating activities. Furthermore, effective social mobilization and sensitization on gender stereotyping will help in increasing the enrolment of girls in TVETs/ formal education. Different activities under 16 days of activism were carried out in the communities and schools of Umerkot and Sanghar District. During these activities a theatre on GBV in education was performed by youth of Project intervention communities at Village Umeed Ali Lashari and total 26 sessions at Schools and communities of both districts conducted with over all participation of 980 people (712 Women/girls and 268 men /boys).

	<p>There is always room for improvement in the area of GTA and therefore an annual reflection at the time of planning, budgeting, development of IEC and implementation by the in house Gender advisors to provide insight of Programme activities through GTA lens.</p>
<p>Girls Empowerment <i>describe status of Girl Empowerment at the start of the programme and the current status of the programme</i></p>	<p>Girls empowerment is the main theme of the YID strategy in Pakistan and has been focused in the YID Programme very comprehensively. Girls empowerment as can be seen from the results of the mid line, has been given a great boost in the past 2-3 years due to the interventions of YID. 25% of girls have taken leadership roles throughout the programme and the 5 year target has been achieved. Most of the Kiran Plus are girls and now through the Kiran Network are provided with a wide spectrum of capacity building and exposure opportunities. Additionally, through the YID Programme, girls are constantly engaged with policy makers and other stakeholders in community mobilisation and advocacy efforts at both local and national levels in addition to representing their communities on multiple media forums. The Meena bazar activities are used to promote girls' empowerment by providing income generation opportunities and similarly all IEC material developed by YIDA focuses on the promotion of girls' empowerment. The information for disseminating the importance of education for girls emphasizes on the benefits of the continuing education and most importantly it is also to increase the retention in schools. Furthermore, the teachers and communities are mobilized to reduce the possibilities of dropout of girls from schools. It is witnessed and often reported that due to poverty, many girls cannot complete their education and they drop out of schools, since they are unable to pay the fee for board exams and other compulsory items required. YID through established school committees offered 463 scholarships to poor girls to continue their education.</p>
<p>Men and boys Engagement <i>describe status of Men and Boys Engagament at the start of the programme and the current status of the programme</i></p>	<p>According to the mid line, active engagement of men and boys in strategies to reduce CM and TP is present but needs to be improved. Although boys and young men are actively engaged to some extent, engagement of older men-particularly fathers is low. Boys and young men expressed they need to get trainings from LHWs as young women do, and to have more employment opportunities which for young women is improving. Young men and boys are largely aware of the harms of CM and TP, irrespective of education status and participation in the Yes I Do programme.</p> <p>YIDA Pakistan recognises the value of engaging with boys and men in its efforts to reduce child marriages and teenage pregnancies. Special attention is paid to ensuring a fair share of boys</p>

	<p>representation in the Kiran Network and on different local and national level platforms. The LSBE curriculum and peer education toolkits have also been especially developed for boys and are taught in all boys' schools. These boys have been sensitised on the rights of girls and women in communities and are strongly supporting in advocacy efforts. Similarly, with the advent of Rutgers Pakistan's Prevention + Programme in Sanghar, a strategy has been developed to further enhance the engagement of boys and men in the YID Programme. Additionally, 25 youth forums and CBOs, with men and boys representation, were organized and sensitized on the issues around child marriage, TP, SRHR and YEE. Benefits of girls' education and empowerment were discussed. Through door to door social mobilization men and boys engagement is ensured so that they can raise voices against social harmful practices, such as child marriages. Additionally, in an attempt to further increase the engagement of men and boys, Prevention + proposed intervention in Sanghar will bring with it a large spectrum of opportunities and expertise in men engagement. YID has developed a strategy to incorporate their expertise in its programming even further.</p>
<p>Meaningful Youth participation (MYP)</p> <p><i>describe status of MYP at the start of the programme and the current status of the programme</i></p>	<p>YIDA Pakistan is very proactive in ensuring Meaningful youth participation in all facets of the YID Programme. This has been ensured at multiple levels. The recently launched Kiran Network has been devised as a youth led network where elected Kirans will play a key role in decision making. As discussed in previous sections, advocacy and community mobilisation efforts are led primarily by Kirans at both local and national levels wherein they advocate for themselves and represent their peers and communities at media forums and seminars. Similarly, selected Kirans are now working as master trainers who provide other Kiran Plus trainings on community mobilisation and advocacy and leadership. Kirans are also permanent members of the YID School Committees. At the YID Alliance level, Kirans are permanent members of the NPSC and the ARM. Meaningful youth participation through the access to information, SRH services, which will turn into a social movement, is transforming attitudes of the communities from harmful, social beliefs and practices, towards improved and change in perceptions and attitudes. For this CBOs/Youth forums are well capacitated, to take up the role of mentors for young boys and girls, in the process of community mobilization, reaching out of school youth and taking advocacy initiatives. Training interventions are targeting the development of communication and leadership skills amongst these boys and girls. In addition, capacity building of the CSOs and existing social networks as well as the staff of the local partner organizations is focused around the issues, covered under the project along with designing and execution of advocacy campaigns.</p>